

Relations Between
Vocational and Educational
Guidance

By GEORGE E. MYERS

1933

*29454



RELATIONS BETWEEN VOCATIONAL AND EDUCATIONAL GUIDANCE¹

GEORGE E. MYERS

*Professor of Vocational Education and Guidance
University of Michigan*

IT should be understood at the beginning that this paper is not limited to the relations between vocational and educational guidance as abstract principles. It is concerned also with their relations when both are at work in an operating school system.

In order to discuss intelligently the relations between these two forms of guidance, it seems wise to obtain first a fairly clear picture of the origin and objectives of each and the activities and provisions which are generally considered necessary in order that these objectives may be realized. It should then be possible to arrive at some conclusions as to what provisions serve both forms of guidance and what belong specifically to each by itself, and to derive some suggestions as to how both may be carried on cooperatively to the best interests of the boys and girls who are served by our schools.

ORIGIN AND MEANING OF VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE

Vocational guidance is an older term than educational guidance. The former was first used, according to the best evidence available, by Frank Parsons, Director of the Vocation Bureau of Boston, in a brief report which bears the date May 1, 1908. The Bureau had been organized as an endowed enterprise connected with the Civic Service House of North Boston in January of the same year for the definite purpose of aiding young people to choose and succeed in suitable vocations. In this report Parsons expressed the belief that "in order to cover the field in the most complete and adequate manner, the work should become a part of the public school system in every community with experts trained as carefully in the art of vocational guidance as men are trained today for medicine or the law, and supplied with every facility that science can devise for testing the senses and capacities and the whole physical,

¹ This paper, presented at the annual meeting of the American Vocational Association, Kansas City, Missouri, in December, 1932, is reprinted from the issues of the *News Bulletin* of the American Vocational Association for May and October, 1933.

intellectual, and emotional make-up of the child.”¹ That the purposes of vocational guidance were not narrowly conceived is shown further by the following quotation from a 1909 report concerning the activities and objectives of the Bureau: “To make clear the need of training and educational equipment for the desirable occupations, and by advice and cooperation to prolong the school period of young people, whether by day, evening, or part-time courses, and also to secure other educational opportunities when needed. To organize personal vocational counseling both for those in school and for those already at work, in order to aid them to plan intelligently for their educational and vocational progress.”²

In 1910 the Bureau, with the cooperation of the Superintendent of Schools, conducted a training course in vocational counseling for a large number of teachers in the schools of the city. Early in 1912 the Boston school system took over the burden of the work carried up to that time by the Vocation Bureau. Vocational guidance thus became a public school enterprise in Boston. While these developments were in progress in Boston, or soon thereafter, the school systems of two or three other large cities made definite provision for vocational guidance and during the next few years the movement spread to many other school systems throughout the country. By 1920 vocational guidance as a specialized and systematic service of public schools to the country's youth had arrived in the educational thought of the country, though its practice was still far from the ideal held by its founder.

WHAT IS INCLUDED IN VOCATIONAL GUIDANCE?

Most of the provisions which are generally considered essential to an effective school program of vocational guidance were at least suggested by Parsons' statement already quoted. As the writer would formulate them, they are:

1. Provision for acquainting high school youth with reliable, significant, and adequate information concerning occupations. This means that a suitable course or courses dealing with occupations should be required of all boys and girls and should be taught by one who is at least as well qualified for this particular work as is the high school teacher of English, Latin, or mathematics to teach his subject.

2. Provision for helping each youth to discover by means of ex-

¹ Frederick J. Allen, *Principles and Problems of Vocational Guidance*, p. 5. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1927.

² *Ibid.*, p. 6.

ploratory experiences and in other ways, his special interests, aptitudes, and limitations, and his personality assets and liabilities that are significant for his vocational choice. This means recognition by all high school teachers of the *exploratory* as well as the general education objective of their subjects, and the selection of content and methods with both of these objectives in mind. It means special attention to the exploratory objective in the practical arts courses and in the so-called extra-curricular activities.

3. Provisions for bringing together in a central office the data concerning each pupil which are significant in relation to his vocational choice. This means the maintenance of a cumulative record system which includes data concerning health, mental alertness, home environment, scholastic achievements, extra-curricular activities, and such special aptitudes and limitations and personality traits as may have come to the attention of any teachers who are alert to the exploratory objective of secondary education or may have been definitely arranged for by means of tests, rating scales, check lists and the like. It means a much more complete system of records than schools usually have kept in the past.

4. Provision for individual vocational counseling of each high school pupil whenever needed, by a vocational counselor who is specially qualified by personality, training, and experience for this difficult task. This means giving each boy and girl expert assistance in weighing and evaluating the data concerning himself in relation to the information concerning the requirements and opportunities of occupations which interest him. It means, of course, that the vocational counselor will take into account in each counseling interview the accumulated data concerning the one interviewed and will add to these data after the interview.

5. Provision for aiding junior and senior high school boys and girls to choose the subjects, curriculums, and schools which will be most helpful in the making of vocational plans and in preparation for carrying out those plans. This means that the vocational counselor must be expected to assist junior high school pupils in choosing between the general, the commercial, and the industrial arts curriculums—curriculums which serve as aids in discovering vocational aptitudes and limitations. It means that the same counselor will help each pupil as he leaves the junior high school to select both the senior high school or vocational school and the curriculum offered by that school which is best suited to his vocational needs and plans, as they have developed up to that time. And the senior high school vocational counselor will aid him on the same basis in choosing between elective subjects—as, for example,

between shorthand, bookkeeping, and salesmanship in the business preparatory curriculum—in changing curriculums if desirable, and in selecting the particular higher institution to attend in case his plans call for further education.

6. Provision by the school system for aiding youth to enter occupational life advantageously when school days are over. This means that someone representing the schools shall, on the one hand, keep in close touch with specific employment needs of the business and industrial establishments of the community and, on the other hand, have readily available the needed information concerning the occupational qualifications of those who wish to leave the schools for employment. It means that some officer or group of officers who have special qualifications must be assigned to this work if it is to be well done.

7. Provision for following up boys and girls after they leave high school to enter occupations in order to aid them in making necessary adjustments to employment life. This means that representatives of the school system should keep closely enough in touch with each young worker to find out whether he starts off well in his work, whether a change to some other kind of work or to the same kind in another position is desirable, and what further preparation he needs in order to do his work as well as possible and to make progress. It means conferences and counseling interviews with individual young workers and new placements for many of them.

CONFUSION AS TO MEANING OF EDUCATIONAL GUIDANCE

Turning now to educational guidance, the origin of this term is less clear. To be sure, the teacher has always been looked upon to some extent as a guide to his pupils along the pathway of learning. And wherever a teacher-pupil relationship exists there is in this sense educational guidance which, upon analysis, proves to be largely a matter of methods of teaching. But this discussion is concerned with educational guidance not as something which has always been incidental to education but as a systematic, planned something which has come to the aid of education in recent years under the specific name *educational guidance*.

The earliest reference to educational guidance found in the Reader's Guide is dated April, 1912. The reference is to an editorial bearing this title in the *Elementary School Teacher*. However, this editorial was not correctly named for it deals wholly with vocational guidance as it was then and has since been defined.

In 1914 Truman L. Kelley's doctor's dissertation entitled "Educa-

tional Guidance" was published. This appears to be the earliest serious use and discussion of the term. Kelley's purpose was to develop a more scientific method of classifying high school students. He was interested in making it possible "to determine, before courses in the high school are taken, what the probable ability of the pupil in question will be in them."¹ In using the term educational guidance he was thinking in terms of aiding the pupil in the selection of high school subjects. He looked upon this as a basis for later vocational guidance.

It should be noted, however, that two years earlier, in 1912, Jesse B. Davis had presented at a meeting of the National Educational Association a paper entitled "Vocational and Moral Guidance through English Composition" which was later developed into a book. Here is evidence of a tendency, appearing early in the life of the movement, to go beyond the original term vocational guidance.

Brewer, in his book "The Vocational Guidance Movement," published in 1918, says: "Educational guidance may be defined as a conscious effort to assist in the intellectual growth of an individual Anything that has to do with instruction or with learning may come under the term educational guidance."² This practically identifies educational guidance with education.

Proctor³ reports that he first offered a university course entitled "Educational and Vocational Guidance" in 1917 at Stanford University. When Proctor later developed this course into book form in 1925 he defined educational guidance as "consisting of all such school activities as have for their purpose the guidance of pupils in their choice of schools, courses of study, or curricula, as well as all activities connected with the discovery of individual differences and the adjustment of teaching methods and content of subjects to the needs and abilities of children."⁴ In addition, this book discusses under separate chapter headings "Guidance in Social and Civic Activities," "Guidance in Health and Physical Activities," "Guidance in the Worthy Use of Leisure Time," "Guidance in Character-Building Activities," and different phases of vocational guidance. He thus treats *guidance* in a more general way than the title of his book would indicate or uses the term *educational* in a very broad

¹ Truman L. Kelley, *Educational Guidance*, p. 4. Columbia University Contributions to Education, No. 71, 1914.

² J. M. Brewer, *The Vocational Guidance Movement*, p. 14. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1918.

³ W. M. Proctor, *Educational and Vocational Guidance*, see preface. Boston: Houghton Mifflin and Company, 1925.

⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 132.

sense in this title. In fact he says, "It is the purpose of this book to present a view of guidance as *having to do* with the whole field of education, and as being on that account concerned with every one of the major activities of life."⁵ One is thus left in some uncertainty as to just what this author means by the term educational guidance, though he clearly does not treat it as synonymous with education.

In 1930, five years after Proctor's book was published, Arthur J. Jones brought out his "Principles of Guidance," from the title of which, it will be observed, all qualifying adjectives such as educational, vocational, and moral are omitted. He defines organized guidance in terms of "any help that is given to an individual that will enable him to make an intelligent choice at the time of a crisis in his life." "Guidance, as defined," says Jones, "is a process that concerns every phase of the life of the individual. Since the individual's life is a unit and not made up of separate parts, guidance must be a unitary process, and any attempt to separate one aspect from another will be correspondingly futile and dangerous."⁶ He points out, however, that certain aspects of guidance are commonly distinguished and should be separately discussed. Jones then proceeds to consider six forms or phases of guidance, as he calls them, pointing out that there are others which will not be given attention in this book. The six are:

1. Vocational guidance
2. Course, curriculum, and school guidance
3. Civic and moral guidance
4. Leisure time, avocational, or cultural guidance
5. Social guidance
6. Leadership guidance

It is worthy of note that the term educational guidance is avoided in this list, though it is used elsewhere in the book as synonymous with "Course, Curriculum, and School Guidance." Perhaps it should be noted, also, that only 16 of his 385 pages are devoted specifically to the third, fourth, fifth, and sixth phases of guidance in his list given above.

Brewer, in his new book "Education as Guidance" treats guidance in its many aspects as having to do, like education, with the whole job of living. He seems to use educational guidance to mean the assistance which is given to boys and girls in making proper progress in their school

⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 13.

⁶ Arthur J. Jones, *Principles of Guidance*, pp. 28, 29. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1930.

work. To use his own words, it is "that portion of guidance which is concerned strictly with the pupil's success in his educational career."¹ More specifically, it includes guidance along the following lines: "How to study; using the common tools of learning; adjusting school life to other activities; regularly attending on school and to school tasks; learning to speak, interview, compose in writing, take examinations, and use libraries; and making the important educational decisions at each of the many forks in the road."² He then discusses problems of educational guidance at the different school levels from the elementary school to the professional school. In chapters following this discussion of educational guidance he deals separately with vocational guidance, religious guidance, and guidance "for home relationships," "for citizenship," "for leisure and recreation," "in personal well-being," "in right doing," "in thoughtfulness and cooperation," and "in wholesome and cultural action." However, in one place³ Brewer treats educational and vocational guidance together as the center from which radiate all of the other guidance activities, educational guidance dominating the earlier part of school life and vocational guidance the latter part.

Koos and Kefauver, like Jones and Brewer, drop all qualifying adjectives in the title of their book published early in 1932.⁴ By means of guidance, as they use the term, they aim to "(1) *distribute youth as effectively as possible to educational and vocational opportunities*, that is to subjects, curricula, extra-curricular activities, schools, higher institutions, and vocations," and "(2) *to help the individual to make the optimal adjustment to educational and vocational situations*."⁵ From this statement one would infer that the authors do not recognize other aspects of guidance than the educational and vocational. They proceed immediately, however, to mention recreation guidance, health guidance, and civic-social-moral guidance, without making it clear what relation these bear to educational guidance. These same authors call attention to "the danger of losing sight of the extremely important service of guidance"⁶ as they define it above by practically identifying it with education as some writers do.

The only conclusion one can reach from the points of view expressed

¹ J. M. Brewer, *Education as Guidance*, p. 113. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1932.

² *Ibid.*, p. 114.

³ *Ibid.*, p. 181.

⁴ L. V. Koos and G. N. Kefauver, *Guidance in Secondary Schools*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1932.

⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 15.

⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 22.

by these various writers is that there is no unanimity as to the meaning of educational guidance. By some it is thought of simply as aid in the choice of subjects, curriculums, and schools. Others conceive it as including, also, assistance in learning how to study, how to use the library, how to take examinations, how to make various adjustments of school life. Still others seem to include health, recreation, social, civic, moral, and other personal adjustments in the field of educational guidance. And some treat guidance as practically synonymous with education itself. It should be noted, also, that similar confusion prevails in the minds of those who have made provision for educational guidance in schools which they administer.

A NEW CONCEPTION OF EDUCATIONAL GUIDANCE

It is obvious that for the purposes of this paper a more definite statement of what is meant by educational guidance is necessary. One cannot consider to advantage the relations between the activities which grow out of so definite a conception as vocational guidance with the activities involved in a conception so cloudy and confused as the one just presented. One is, then, faced with three alternatives.

One may conclude that educational guidance is not definable, judging by results thus far achieved, and therefore a consideration of the relations of vocational guidance to it is fruitless.

One may decide that the term may be definable but is not yet defined and that the proposed discussion of relations to it must be postponed until there is some agreement among its advocates as to what educational guidance is.

One may attempt to formulate a definition or conception of educational guidance which seems likely to be accepted as sound and then consider the relations of vocational guidance to this conception.

The last alternative, though by far the most difficult, appears to be the one which should be chosen.

How, then, shall educational guidance be defined? This can best be done, in the writer's judgment, by relating it first to the meaning of education.

Education is a process of individual development under the influences of environment. Whether he wishes it or not, the process goes on throughout the individual's life, now rapidly, now slowly; at one time in a manner which is wholesome for society and the individual, at another time in a manner unwholesome.

Organized education, with which this discussion is concerned, is

society's effort to direct and speed up this process, by means of a controlled environment, along lines which are wholesome both for society and for the individual. Society's success in this effort depends, of course, upon what is accepted as wholesome and what kind of environment is provided by society's educational agency the school. With the first of these two, important as it is, the present discussion is not directly concerned.

The school environment provided by society for educational purposes is, and must be, a complex thing containing many elements. A large number of these elements are important for the common development of all pupils alike. For example, certain language, arithmetic, and civic elements are of this type. This is just another way of saying that there is a group of educational needs common to all which our schools endeavor to serve by means of the environment it creates for its pupils. Again, on account of differences between human beings, some elements of the secondary school environment are more important for one pupil and others for another. Artistic elements best serve the needs of one, musical elements the needs of another, science elements of another, and so on, *after certain common needs of all pupils along these lines have been met.*

On the one hand, pupils have no choice among the various elements of the school environment insofar as school activities deal with the common needs of all. All pupils are subjected to the same elements regardless of individual differences. Elementary school work as a whole (grades one to six) and those courses of the junior and senior high school that are required of all are planned for the purpose of serving these common needs and are not, therefore, open to choice. On the other hand, choices must be made by pupils from that large group of elements which make up the other activities of junior and senior high school, including extra-curricular activities, and which are provided for the purpose of meeting needs based upon individual differences. Decisions must be reached as to which of two or more possible courses of action shall be taken in order that the greatest educational good may be realized by each pupils.

Educational guidance, as far as the school is concerned, is the process of giving assistance to pupils in making these choices and adjustments which are significant for their educational progress. Educational guidance, like vocational, is thus based upon *two* sets of differences, those between individual human beings and those between certain groups of opportunities and requirements, in this case educational. Without the possibility of choice between two or more courses of action there can be no guidance.

Any attempt to limit educational guidance in this way to the *elective* phases of education immediately gives rise to challenging questions: "Is not helping a pupil in the elementary school to adjust his load to his ability just as truly educational guidance? Or adapting to his intelligence the methods of teaching him? Or aiding him to establish wholesome relations with his fellow pupils?" To all such questions the answer is an emphatic no. Educational guidance is a process concerned with bringing about between an individual pupil with his distinctive characteristics on the one hand, and *differing groups* of opportunities and requirements on the other, a favorable setting for the individual's development. If there is a single group of opportunities and requirements, as is the case with a fixed curriculum, the problem is simply one of *education* in a setting already determined and not one of educational guidance.

This does not at all mean that individual differences should be ignored in meeting common educational needs. Because of individual differences, different methods and techniques and even some differences in quantity of content may be used for the purpose of accomplishing the common desired objectives. But these different methods and techniques are used in order that the process of education may go on more easily and more successfully by means of the same elements of environment. Some of these methods and techniques are borrowed from vocational guidance, in connection with which they first gained general recognition. Only confusion results from applying the name educational guidance to certain methods and techniques of the vocational guidance process when these are used, as they often can be very effectively, in the general work of the school.

As defined above, educational guidance cannot be confused with education. Nor can guidance used without a qualifying adjective be so confused. In fact guidance *per se* appears to be an abstraction. One is not just guided. One is guided with reference to some choice or adjustment which he is called upon to make and these choices are concerned with specific interests such as the educational or vocational, or with two or more of these in combination.

Again, with acceptance of this conception of educational guidance most of the so-called forms or aspects of guidance become forms or aspects of education, while others simply disappear into thin air. Among the former are "health," "social," "civic," and "moral" guidance. Among the latter certainly is "mental" guidance.

What is good health for one is good health for all. There are not a thousand different kinds of good health about which one needs to know

and from which one must make a choice for himself according to his personal characteristics. What the individual needs is to learn what knowledge, habits, and behavior are necessary to good health and how they can be made a part of his life. He needs *education* as to the advantages of good health and as to ways of acquiring and maintaining it. He needs practice in health habits, which to some extent, are determined for him by his own physical condition, but which, in the main, are alike for all. But practice is merely the *drill part* of *education*. He needs strength of will to choose courses of action which he knows are healthful in preference to those which he knows are unhealthful. But strength of will in such a situation is determined largely by habits already formed and, in any case, is a product of inheritance and *education* rather than of anything which can properly be called health guidance. Insofar as the term guidance is used in the situation at all, it is applied to a *method* of education.

Fundamentally what is good civic conduct for one member of a community is good civic conduct for all. There are not a thousand different kinds of civic conduct, all good in themselves, about which one should know and from which one must choose, according to one's personal qualities or characteristics. The problem which confronts our schools in relation to civic conduct is that of bringing about the *same result*, as nearly as possible, in all pupils, differing as they do in intelligence, personality, home environment, and previous education in civic matters. This is a problem of education, involving acquisition of knowledge as to what constitutes the desired conduct, cultivation of attitudes and habits which characterize it and the will to achieve it. Only by identifying education with guidance can this process be called civic guidance. However, in doing this job of *civic education* some of the methods and techniques which long have characterized vocational guidance may be used to advantage, namely, study of the individual, exploratory experiences for the purposes of discovering his civic assets and liabilities, and individual counseling. And this is the only possible justification for applying the name civic guidance to what goes on, thus applying to what is done the name of the methods by which it is done.

In the same manner it can be shown that worthy social conduct and worthy moral conduct are products of the process of *education* rather than of social and moral guidance and that these so-called forms of guidance are nothing more than methods, borrowed from vocational guidance, of achieving desirable educational results along social and moral lines. In each of these cases, as well as in those of health and civic conduct,

there is an established goal and a well marked route leading to it. Some will go farther than others, and some travel faster, during their school lives. The problem is that of helping each one to make as much progress as he can along a common highway.

Recreational guidance, however, is a different matter. There are many different kinds of recreation, all of them good, from which one may choose with reference to his personal characteristics, his education, and his vocation. The problem of schools in relation to recreation is definitely one of guidance as well as of education and the term recreational guidance is entirely justified.

Helping the pupil to learn by means of class period, lesson assignment, library reference work, suggestions on how to study, etc. are not educational guidance; these are teaching. And teaching is a grand old word which does not yet need a modern substitute. But teaching is more effective when it is preceded by wise assistance to the pupil in making his selection of subjects, curriculum, and school; in other words, when educational guidance helps to provide a favorable setting for the teaching.

In this connection an expression sometimes used—"the guidance attitude in teaching"—needs a word of explanation. This expression seems to carry the idea of a friendly, helpful spirit on the part of the teacher and of the use of some of the methods and techniques which have characterized vocational guidance from its beginning. A teaching attitude and teaching methods are implied rather than any activity which may properly be called educational guidance.

WHAT IS INCLUDED IN EDUCATIONAL GUIDANCE?

Now, in the light of the conception of educational guidance presented above the principal provisions necessary if effective educational guidance is to be carried on in a school system include the following:

1. Provision for aiding pupils to obtain information concerning the educational opportunities that are possible for them, with the requirements of these. This means definite instruction for the purpose of opening up to youth what life has to offer along educational lines and what steps and requirements are necessary in order to take advantage of the offerings.
2. Provision for aiding each pupil to become aware of his most important personal assets, liabilities, and needs which are significant in relation to these opportunities and requirements. Physical, mental, emotional, and personality traits are all involved. This calls for definite

recognition of the exploratory function of education, both in its content and in its method, in order that the pupil may discover his strong and weak points.

3. Provision for bringing together, in form for ready use by counselors, data concerning each pupil—his interest, aptitudes, abilities, achievements, limitations, and attitudes—which are significant in relation to the opportunities and requirements mentioned above. This means a more extensive program of tests and measurements and a more complete system of records of the pupil's background, achievements, and exploratory experiences than many school systems have yet provided.

4. Provision for counseling each pupil—helping him to compare his assets and liabilities with the opportunities and requirements of the various educational choices open to him. This means individual interviews with pupils from time to time by counselors who are prepared for this work. Out of these interviews and those concerned with vocational guidance the pupil should acquire a method of procedure in arriving at decisions and making choices which would be invaluable to him throughout life.

VOCATIONAL AND EDUCATIONAL GUIDANCE ACTIVITIES COMPARED

This list of provisions necessary for effective educational guidance will recall a similar list for vocational guidance near the beginning of this paper.

The first item in both lists calls for assistance to the pupil in obtaining information. In one case it is information concerning the field of occupations which interest the individual. In the other case it is information concerning the opportunities which life has to offer in the way of education. How shall these two kinds of information be obtained by pupils; from separate special courses, from a combined special course, from the regular subjects offered, or from the home room teacher?

In the writer's judgment, special instruction concerning vocations by a teacher who is as well prepared for this work as teachers of mathematics or English are prepared to teach their subjects is essential. A wealth of subject matter—living, changing subject matter of high educational as well as vocational guidance value—is available. Information concerning subjects offered and curriculums and schools available may properly be included in such material, since choices in these matters so often depend upon the vocational interests of pupils or are important means of discovering such interests. Also, some attention must be given in a course concerned with the requirements of occupations to health,

social, moral, and recreational information. And the pupil thus obtains this information in a setting and with a motivation which give it added force. It is proposed therefore that certain aspects of the needed information along all these lines—aspects to be determined by their relationship to vocational interests—be included in a course devoted largely to vocational information and the other aspects to be given attention in the health education work, the civics courses and the home room work of the school. The course might be spread one or two hours per week over several semesters of the six year high school period.

The second item in both lists is concerned with aiding the pupil to discover by means of exploratory experiences, obtained chiefly through school subjects and extra-class activities, his special interests, aptitudes, and limitations; his personal assets and liabilities. The body of information thus built up in the pupil's mind would seem to be in most respects the same whether its purpose is vocational or educational guidance. For both purposes a varied and well-planned exploratory program is essential; and also a proper recognition of the exploratory function of all of secondary education. However, it must be recognized that not all pupils should go through the same exploratory experiences.

The third item is concerned with collecting and recording in form for ready use data gathered by the school staff from the pupil's exploratory experiences, from tests and measurements of various kinds, and from other sources. This material is for use in counseling the pupil. If a good job is to be done the same data are important whether the counseling is to be vocational or educational. As far as this item is concerned, vocational and educational guidance are identical.

The fourth item on the educational guidance list and the fourth and fifth items on the vocational are concerned with counseling. Both have already been defined. What are their relations? The activities carried on are similar. As has been seen, the data concerning the individual who is to be counseled are practically the same. And the pupil should come to the counseling interview with the same information concerning himself in either case. But the objectives are different. And the approach is different. In one case attention centers around what the pupil wants to do in life and relates his assets and liabilities to this. It must deal with his educational plans, because they are closely related to his vocational interests. If he has not chosen an occupation it seeks to help him plan an educational program with a view to a wise choice later, taking account of the exploratory values of subjects that are available.

In the other case attention is focussed upon the pupil's general edu-

cation. His best development during school days is sought. His assets and liabilities are compared with the various educational opportunities and requirements which lie ahead. Attention is given to vocational interests only insofar as educational choices are influenced by them. Wise choices and adjustments pertaining to school life are the goal sought through the counseling interview.

It is obvious that both kinds of counseling are needed and that neither can be completely separated from the other. However, it is quite impossible for one to do vocational counseling that is worthy the name without special qualifications for this work. On the other hand, educational counseling, much less complicated, has always been done on a large scale by principals and teachers as part of their regular work. It was done under the name of education. To be sure, most of it in the past has not been scientific nor has it always been systematic. Only since efforts have been made to give it a more scientific and systematic character, borrowing methods and techniques from vocational counseling, has it been called educational counseling. The logical method of providing for both would seem to be to place in charge of the counseling program in a school someone who is qualified to do vocational counseling and who, at the same time, understands and is sympathetic with educational counseling needs, and then to expect him to have the cooperation of the entire school staff in carrying forward his program. He himself would do most of the vocational counseling and much of the educational. All of his work and the entire program would be permeated by both points of view.

The two remaining items in a vocational guidance program, placement and follow-up, are found in a program of educational guidance only to a limited extent in case of those who go to higher schools. The student is given some assistance in choosing a school to attend and responsibility is then passed on with him to the higher institution. For those who do not continue their schooling, educational guidance has thus far offered practically nothing in the nature of a follow-up program, though it has interesting possibilities. In case of vocational placement and follow-up, special provision must be made by either having special officers do this work or by assigning it to the vocational counselors. It must not be forgotten, however, that in these two activities is provided a valuable check upon the whole program of educational and vocational guidance, and indeed upon the whole program of education. It may be noted at this point that recreational guidance should be carried along with the vocational and educational. In fact it is impossible to make ade-

quate provision for only one of these without providing also for the other two. However, vocational guidance is the most complicated, has the most direct and vital appeal to the greatest number, and often gives point and motivation to the other two. It may well form the center of the program.

A COOPERATIVE PROGRAM NECESSARY

To summarize, then, vocational guidance is an older, more clearly defined, and better understood term than educational guidance. Both are processes rather than methods, with certain methods in common for carrying on the processes effectively. Both are concerned with two sets of differences—those between individuals and those between groups of opportunities and requirements, each group representing a possible course of action open to each individual. Both consist of giving assistance to individuals in (1) making choices between these possible courses of action and (2) making adjustments growing out of the choices. Each has to do with providing as favorable a setting as possible for one aspect of individual development and achievement. Each should eventuate in self guidance of a particular kind. Vocational and educational guidance cannot be entirely separated. In carrying on the former effectively much of the latter must be done and in a good program of the latter much attention must be given to the former. There are, however, four specialized aspects of vocational guidance which require special provision. These are vocational information, vocational counseling, placement, and follow-up. Specially trained workers are necessary for these activities. On the other hand, these educational guidance activities which may not readily be cared for under, and indeed be considered part of, an adequate vocational guidance program may usually be performed by subject teachers, home room teachers, and other officers of the school staff. Both should be considered *school* enterprises in which all members of the staff must cooperate generously.

It is unfortunate that out of the various confused conceptions of educational guidance, or at least coincident with their development, has come a tendency, especially among school administrators, to emphasize and exalt educational guidance at the expense of vocational guidance. To be sure, all of the writers quoted above stress the importance of vocational guidance as one aspect or phase of guidance. But some of these writers and many school administrators seem to be under the spell of that old saying "Making a life is more important than making a living," and therefore tend to treat *vocational* guidance as on a somewhat

lower level than educational guidance which they think of as concerned with making a life. There is a disposition to forget that making a life and making a living are absolutely inseparable for most mortals and that vocational success is far more than making a living. An individual does not live in a vacuum. A great part of his waking hours is spent in his vocation. Usually his major contribution to society is made through his vocation, and many of his greatest personal satisfactions should come to him, and do if his vocation is suitable, from the same source. His ability, outside of so-called working hours, to make valuable contributions to society, including his home, and also to find personal satisfaction, is conditioned by his vocational success and his vocational environment. His thinking, behavior, and associations are similarly conditioned. One might almost as well talk of flying in a vacuum as to making a life independently of one's vocation.

Another reason for the tendency noted above is that vocational guidance, when well done, calls for more radical changes in the administrative set-up of the schools and for highly trained specialists of a type not now found in most school systems. It has been easier and more economical, especially in a period of financial stringency, to encourage under the name of guidance such activities as can be cared for by the regular school staff. And the public, knowing that the word guidance is used in describing this work, does not realize how little vocational guidance really is included.

Indeed this tendency to emphasize other forms of guidance has made such progress that one wonders at times if vocational guidance is not in danger of being thrown out of his own house—a house built with great labor and care during the past twenty-five years. Or if not thrown out, at least of being forced to occupy a back room and turn over the rest of the house to a large group who claim to be relatives and who have adopted part of his name and part of his way of living. The following warning from Arthur J. Jones is timely: "There is real danger that the (guidance) movement will become so broad as to be practically meaningless and dissipate itself into the thin air of general education or general instruction."¹

A better understanding of the relations between vocational and educational guidance should do much to prevent this disaster to a movement rich in possibilities of service to youth.

¹ Arthur J. Jones, *Principles of Guidance*, p. 369.

